

North Yorkshire Council

Harrogate and Knaresborough Area Constituency Committee

23 November 2023

Response to the Petition 'EV Charge Point installation in Knaresborough'

1.0 Purpose of the Report

- 1.1 To provide a response to the requests from the petition raised by the Harrogate and Knaresborough Area Constituency Committee Members to Executive
- 1.2 To ask the Area Constituency Committee to note the response.

2.0 Background

- 2.1 A petition, with over 500 signatures by people who live, work or study in the Harrogate/Knaresborough area, was received by North Yorkshire Council and presented at the Harrogate and Knaresborough Area Constituency Committee (ACC) on 14 September 2023. The Committee considered the petition about EV charging point (EVCP) installation in Knaresborough which stated they were causing significant negative impact on traders in the town centre, to the attractiveness to visitors and potentially to the environment through increased congestion associated with the choice of Chapel Street as a location for 10 charging points. In response, the Committee gave its support to EV charging to reduce pollution in the town but acknowledged EV charging point installation has been poorly implemented in Knaresborough due to inadequate engagement and communication with local residents, business and local councillors. The petition provided the following context:

"We, the undersigned, being the businesses, residents and visitors to Knaresborough, regret the timing, location and lack of engagement undertaken in the installation of ten EV charging points in our Town Centre short stay car park. We therefore call upon North Yorkshire Council to enter into urgent dialogue to discuss a phased transition to full electric vehicle provision and safeguard our town centre businesses by maximising the availability of parking for all vehicle users until a greater need arises"

- 2.2 The ACC agreed with the nine requests from the presenter of the petition (as listed in recommendation (i) below), and agreed to make the following recommendations:
 - i. We call on the Executive to:
 - 1) Seek to renegotiate the contract for the Chapel Street chargers and consider a phased approach to the 10 active EV Chapel Street town centre spaces, e.g., monitor usage and have some as mixed use during the day (8am-6pm) until the demand for EV charging points increases. Current figures show the EV only spaces are underused by 80%. The spaces could still be used for resident charging overnight between 6pm and 8am. A 14-hour available charging period is much more realistic than the 4hr daytime limit, which only allows for an added range of 28 miles.
 - 2) Actively engage with the third party with whom NYC has the EV contract for Knaresborough to see if a compromise can be reached, as outlined above, especially given that the town was a pilot location.
 - 3) Provide clarity on whether electric vehicles are permitted to park in EV only spaces, even if they are not charging.
 - 4) Improve the signage around EV parking and the Car Club scheme in Knaresborough and raise awareness about the latter.
 - 5) Monitor the air quality in and around Chapel Street as a consequence of the additional congestion and pollution.

- 6) Urgently to introduce a park and ride scheme that links the York Place long stay car park (suffering from poor pedestrian access to the Town Centre) to compensate for the loss of Town Centre parking and consider extending this to Conyngham Hall.
- 7) Remove the parking restrictions in the Conyngham Hall tourist car park and make the 14 inactive EV only spaces available to all until a hook up date is fixed.
- 8) Monitor usage of the 14 EV Conyngham Hall spaces once these are activated and ensure that supply and demand are proportional for current needs.
- 9) Improve all signage for car parking on each entry point to the town including real time information about availability of places.

2.3 Subsequently the recommendation was considered at a meeting of the Executive on 17 October 2023 with the following additional recommendations for consideration:

- ii. A full review of all parking in Knaresborough be undertaken within the next six months to ensure spaces, pricing and locations are in line with the needs of the town for both residents and visitors.
- iii. NYC develop a strategy for EV charging, including on street charging, rather than relying on piecemeal funding and projects that run the risk of poor implementation, undertaking appropriate engagement to ensure local resident buy-in

2.4 It was resolved that the specific recommendations made by the Harrogate and Knaresborough ACC at their meeting on 14 September 2023, as listed in this report, be delegated to the Executive Member for Highways & Transportation for his consideration.

3.0 Response to this request

3.1 Improving electric vehicle (EV) charging provision across North Yorkshire is part of our wider climate plan to reduce emissions and improve air quality. NYC's strategy for rollout of EV Infrastructure will play a key role in achieving local, regional and national ambitions associated with decarbonisation (for North Yorkshire to be Carbon Zero by 2034 and Carbon Negative by 2040). We have many residents and visitors contacting us to tell us they want to make the switch to EV or visit North Yorkshire but there is a reluctance due to the lack of infrastructure currently in place, especially where on-street parking is required. We need to provide this infrastructure to give people the confidence they can get around without running out of charge and be a part of this positive change.

3.2 Regarding points 1 and 2, as outlined at section 2.2, the contract with the third party, known as the Charging Point Operator, is not able to be renegotiated. The grant funding conditions, which require the EVCP's to be installed on a permanent basis, are set by the Office for Zero Emission Vehicles (OZEV). OZEV are not able to be as flexible on this scheme as we would like, though we continue our discussions with them, this is because the scheme was delivered with On Street Residential Charge Point Scheme (ORCS) funding which has very strict rules about how the funding should be spent and the permanency of the scheme.

3.3 Further, implementing the proposal to allow all vehicles to park in the spaces at Chapel Street until demand increases undermines the North Yorkshire Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Rollout Strategy¹, which sets out a series of actions the council should take to encourage the uptake of electric vehicles (EVs) and ultimately to contribute to the local, regional, and national decarbonisation targets. NYC would also be in breach of its grant conditions and there may be clawback on the £240,000 used to install chargers across the Harrogate area and it could also impact future funding bids, including the current £4.88m bid for the Local Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Fund (LEVI).

¹ [NYC EV Infrastructure Rollout Strategy](#)

- 3.4 With regard to utilisation, though the EVCPs are not currently fully utilised EV uptake in the Harrogate area is already showing exponential growth and, as a result, experience tells us that EVCP utilisation will follow. Since the information, that currently any vehicle can park in the EV bays (because a Traffic Regulation Order (TRO) has not been made), has been made public by local media we have seen the utilisation of the charge points is dropping, the bays are now being taken up by vehicles with an internal combustion engine (ICE).
- 3.5 For clarification Chapel Street has never been a pilot location and 4hrs of charging would see a range increase of roughly 128 miles, not 28 miles, depending on the battery capability.
- 3.6 On point 3 an EV can park in the EV Only bays without charging and will not receive a penalty charging notice (PCN), however, once a TRO is implemented, subject to review, motorists will need to pay to park and pay to charge. At present:
1. Any vehicle can park in the EV bays at Chapel Street and will not receive a Penalty Charge Notice (PCN) as long as the user has paid the fee to park in the car park; in Chapel Street you must pay to park between 8am and 6pm
 2. An EV parked in the bays does not have to be charging and will not receive a PCN as long as the user has paid the fee to park in the car park; in Chapel Street you must pay to park between 8am and 6pm
 3. Any vehicle using the EV bays at Chapel Street during the hours of 6pm and 8am can park for free but must pay to charge
- 3.7 Once a TRO is implemented:
1. A petrol or diesel vehicle parked in the EV only bays will be issued a PCN
 2. Any EV parked in an EV Only bay is required to be charging
 3. Subject to review, it is anticipated that will need to pay the fee to park in the space and the fee to charge their vehicle.
- 3.8 Point 4 asked to improve the signage around EV parking and the Car Club scheme in Knaresborough and raise awareness about the latter. Currently there is an internal review relating to Off Street Car Parking Orders across North Yorkshire to enable us to align definitions for EV charging. Parking signage is being considered alongside of the Off Street Car Parking Orders review. NYC is considering the following to improve signage and wayfinding in the area;
1. We will install some temporary signs at Chapel Street advising that the bays are free to park in during the hours of 6pm and 8am.
 2. We will improve the website to better signpost the Strategy concepts and where users can charge.
 3. We are reviewing charging prices across the region with a view to standardising rates; which is underway.
 4. We seek to improve digital access and information – The council is currently seeking to join the National Parking Platform (NPP) which will mean that customers can find all NYC car parks on an app.
 5. The council has applied for grant funding to expand the number of ‘bay sensors’ into Knaresborough and Scarborough so that real time parking availability can be seen by customers reducing circulation times looking for parking spaces, this will include EV bays both On and Off-Street
 6. We are looking to review, repair and replace existing signage within the town
 7. We will engage with the community on EVCP’s, their use and officially launch the EV car club
- 3.9 It is acknowledged and agreed that the car club should have been more widely publicised when it was launched. A communications and engagement plan is currently being developed for the new network of EVCP’s which considers existing infrastructure, messaging and engagement.
- 3.10 On point 5, we already monitor air quality as a consequence of the Air Quality

Management Areas (AQMAS) at the junction of the High Street and Bond End and we continue to do so.

- 3.11 Arguably there is no additional congestion/pollution as a result of the charging points being installed at Chapel Street. It is claimed that the cars that were already unable to park (because Chapel Street car park was full before the EVCPs were installed) and now additional cars (those that now are unable to park at Chapel Street because of the 10 EV bays being installed) are driving around town looking for spaces, however, we have observed the EV bays being used by ICE vehicles and, since the ACC report was publicised, utilisation of the EVCP units has dropped. Further, the income generated for car parks in central Knaresborough for June and July 2023 is greater than that of the same period in 2022, and there has been no increase in Tariff, which suggests that the inclusion of the EVCPs has not had a negative impact on footfall through the car parks.
- 3.12 On point 6, the Integrated Passenger Transport team has considered this request and has advised that whilst North Yorkshire Council provides financial support for the bus network, using both council funds and accessing grants from central government, this budget is fully committed helping to maintain much of the current bus network. As the funding available is limited, it is necessary to prioritise how the resources that are available to us are used. Our support is focussed on maintaining core daytime bus routes across North Yorkshire to give communities access to essential services but does not include funding services only running short distances within town centres. Knaresborough bus station is only 400m from York Place car park with a footway and a fairly flat gradient. The cost of the proposed bus service would also be significant, estimated at around £130,000 per year for a regular service and with no fares income to offset any of the cost. Driver availability is a national problem with all bus operators finding recruitment a challenge and it would be difficult to staff an additional route such as this. Also, capacity is limited within Knaresborough Bus Station and the current site wouldn't be able to accommodate a new regular service without an impact on existing routes.
- 3.13 In regard to Conyngham Hall, points 7 and 8, NYC are experiencing issues with Northern Powergrid establishing a connection to the EVCP's; so even though the EVCPs are installed they have no power, and they are bagged to indicate this. We have removed the parking cones to enable these bays to be used by all vehicles. The issue with Northern Powergrid has been escalated and we are currently expecting to have this resolved in January 2024. We monitor usage of all EVCPs across North Yorkshire and will continue to do so as the network expands. This will be facilitated by the newly established Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Team which sits within the Major Projects portfolio in the Environment directorate.
- 3.14 On point 9, currently there is an internal review relating to Off Street Car Parking Orders across North Yorkshire to enable us to align definitions for EV charging. Parking signage is being considered alongside of the review. Listed in section 3.8 of this report are the considerations NYC is giving to improve signage and wayfinding in the area.
- 3.15 At point ii (see section 2.3 above), the petitioner requests the service considers a full review of all parking in Knaresborough be undertaken within the next six months, however, as we are undertaking a review of the Local Transport Plan (LTP), which sets the policy and investment approach for highways and transport within the county that will then inform any subsequent Car Parking Reviews, and this process will take much longer than six months it is not feasible to provide a response to the review within the requested timeframe.
- 3.16 Finally, the North Yorkshire Council Electric Vehicle Public Charging Infrastructure Rollout Strategy² is a public document, adopted by NYC Executive Members on 2 May 2023. The Strategy is the county-wide rollout plan for EVCP infrastructure, the report identifies the forecast number of EVCP's required to be delivered by 2030 to meet demand and how to

² [NYC EV Public Charging Infrastructure Rollout Strategy](#)

deliver them through a series of actions which include consideration of on-street charging solutions, rural charging solutions and working with businesses to support them with their own decarbonisation plans.

- 3.17 Prior to Local Government Reorganisation (LGR) the responsibility for strategy and delivery of EVCPs in off-street car parks and on their land was with the former district/borough local authorities. The Harrogate Borough Council (HBC) Ultra-Low Emission Vehicle (ULEV) strategy (2019) is a ten-point plan which sat within the Harrogate Borough Council carbon reduction strategy and alongside the Air Quality Management Plan. This strategy was consulted on in 2018 and the response supported the creation of a public charging network as the top priority. The Strategy has economic growth at its core. With the introduction of the Unitary Authority, it should be noted that the principles and actions within the ULEV Strategy still apply but have been consolidated and included in the wider North Yorkshire Strategy which is being used as a guide for network planning across the county, expected to lead to the mass rollout of EVCPs.

4.0 Next Steps

- 4.1 Moving forward officers will continue to engage with OZEV regarding phased delivery opportunities and will be a consideration when planning the delivery of the new network of EVCP's.
- 4.2 We are going implement the TRO's as soon as possible to enable us to make the charging bays at Chapel Street available to EV's only, requiring the vehicle to be charging and, subject to review, that the user must pay to park as well as to charge. We are also reviewing the signage and wayfinding improvements as set out at section 3.8 of this report.
- 4.3 We will develop a communications and engagement plan. NYC is keen to carry out more community engagement once we have appointed a charging point operator (CPO) and progress with rollout of approximately 1500 new EVCP's. We understand that 62% of future emissions reductions depend on behaviour change so it is essential we do this. It will be appreciated that engaging with every community in North Yorkshire, whilst trying to focus on delivery at pace and scale with a relatively small team, will be difficult, however, as we develop our communications and engagement plan, early in the new year, Councillors and Members will be at the fore to help us engage, consult and collaborate with their local communities.
- 4.4 Finally, we will continue to monitor air quality and EVCP usage in the area and work with partners to activate the EVCP's at Conyngham Hall.

5.0 FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 Costs associated with developing and rolling out a communications and engagement plan will be met from the Capability Fund grant as part of the wider EV Rollout Strategy. The potential financial implications associated with the requests of the petition are discussed within this report.

6.0 LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

- 6.1 A legal review of the contract with the Officer for Zero Emission Vehicles and, separately, the contract with the charging point supplier has taken place and the response is based on information that was derived from this.

7.0 EQUALITIES IMPLICATIONS

- 7.1 A screening assessment was undertaken, and an EIA was considered not proportionate. Please see Appendix A.

8.0 CLIMATE CHANGE IMPLICATIONS

8.1 There are no climate implications as a result of this response. Please see Appendix B.

9.0 Recommendations

9.1 That the Committee notes the response to the petition.

APPENDICES:

Appendix A – Equalities Impact Assessment

Appendix B – Climate Change Impact Assessment

BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS: None

Karl Battersby
Corporate Director Environment
County Hall
Northallerton

Report Author – Keisha Moore, Senior Transport Planning Officer
Presenter of Report – Keisha Moore, Senior Transport Planning Officer

Note: Members are invited to contact the author in advance of the meeting with any detailed queries or questions.

Initial equality impact assessment screening form			
This form records an equality screening process to determine the relevance of equality to a proposal, and a decision whether or not a full EIA would be appropriate or proportionate.			
Directorate	Environment		
Service area	Highways and Transport		
Proposal being screened	Response to the Petition 'EV Charge Point installation in Knaresborough'		
Officer(s) carrying out screening	Keisha Moore		
What are you proposing to do?	Respond to Area Constituency Committee members about a series of requests made regarding car parking in Knaresborough		
Why are you proposing this? What are the desired outcomes?	That members note the response and officers take away relevant actions		
Does the proposal involve a significant commitment or removal of resources? Please give details.	No		
Impact on people with any of the following protected characteristics as defined by the Equality Act 2010, or NYC's additional agreed characteristics			
As part of this assessment, please consider the following questions:			
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To what extent is this service used by particular groups of people with protected characteristics? Does the proposal relate to functions that previous consultation has identified as important? Do different groups have different needs or experiences in the area the proposal relates to? 			
If for any characteristic it is considered that there is likely to be an adverse impact or you have ticked 'Don't know/no info available', then a full EIA should be carried out where this is proportionate. You are advised to speak to your directorate representative for advice if you are in any doubt.			
Protected characteristic	Potential for adverse impact		Don't know/No info available
	Yes	No	
Age		X	
Disability		X	
Sex		X	
Race		X	
Sexual orientation		X	
Gender reassignment		X	
Religion or belief		X	
Pregnancy or maternity		X	
Marriage or civil partnership		X	
People in rural areas		X	
People on a low income		X	
Carer (unpaid family or friend)		X	
Are from the Armed Forces Community		X	
Does the proposal relate to an area where there are known inequalities/probable impacts (for example, disabled people's access to public transport)? Please give details.	N/A		
Will the proposal have a significant effect on how other organisations operate? (for example, partners, funding criteria, etc.). Do any of these organisations support people	No, this is a response to members only.		

with protected characteristics? Please explain why you have reached this conclusion.				
Decision (Please tick one option)	EIA not relevant or proportionate:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Continue to full EIA:	<input type="checkbox"/>
Reason for decision	This is an update to members not a proposal or recommendation to do anything at this stage			
Signed (Assistant Director or equivalent)	Barrie Mason			
Date	03/11/2023			

Climate change impact assessment

The purpose of this assessment is to help us understand the likely impacts of our decisions on the environment of North Yorkshire and on our aspiration to achieve net carbon neutrality by 2030, or as close to that date as possible. The intention is to mitigate negative effects and identify projects which will have positive effects.

This document should be completed in consultation with the supporting guidance. The final document will be published as part of the decision making process and should be written in Plain English.

If you have any additional queries which are not covered by the guidance please email climatechange@northyorks.gov.uk

Please note: You may not need to undertake this assessment if your proposal will be subject to any of the following:

Planning Permission
Environmental Impact Assessment
Strategic Environmental Assessment

However, you will still need to summarise your findings in in the summary section of the form below.

Please contact climatechange@northyorks.gov.uk for advice.

Title of proposal	Response to the Petition 'EV Charge Point installation in Knaresborough'
Brief description of proposal	Respond to Area Constituency Committee members about a series of requests made regarding car parking in Knaresborough
Directorate	BES
Service area	Highways and Transportation
Lead officer	Keisha Moore
Names and roles of other people involved in carrying out the impact assessment	
Date impact assessment started	01/11/2023

Options appraisal

Were any other options considered in trying to achieve the aim of this project? If so, please give brief details and explain why alternative options were not progressed.

Alternative options have been considered and consulted on (internally across the directorate) throughout the preparation of this report and the final recommendation is a result of the feedback received from those key stakeholders and the experience of officers.

What impact will this proposal have on council budgets? Will it be cost neutral, have increased cost or reduce costs?

Please explain briefly why this will be the result, detailing estimated savings or costs where this is possible.

The proposal will not affect the council's budget at this time except for a small amount of officer time to organise the promotion of the Car Club vehicles in Harrogate.

<p>How will this proposal impact on the environment?</p> <p>N.B. There may be short term negative impact and longer term positive impact. Please include all potential impacts over the lifetime of a project and provide an explanation.</p>	<p>Positive impact (Place a X in the box below where</p>	<p>No impact (Place a X in the box below where</p>	<p>Negative impact (Place a X in the box below where</p>	<p>Explain why will it have this effect and over what timescale?</p> <p>Where possible/relevant please include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Changes over and above business as usual • Evidence or measurement of effect • Figures for CO₂e • Links to relevant documents 	<p>Explain how you plan to mitigate any negative impacts.</p>	<p>Explain how you plan to improve any positive outcomes as far as possible.</p>	
<p>Minimise greenhouse gas emissions e.g. reducing emissions from travel, increasing energy efficiencies etc.</p>	Emissions from travel	*			The EV car club will be promoted in favour of private ICE vehicles and the overall impact of EV take up should see GHG emissions reductions		Widely promote the car club and EVCP's. Share information and seek buy in from all stakeholders
	Emissions from construction		*				
	Emissions from running of buildings		*				
	Other		*				
Minimise waste : Reduce, reuse, recycle and compost e.g. reducing use of single use plastic			*				
Reduce water consumption			*				

<p>How will this proposal impact on the environment?</p> <p>N.B. There may be short term negative impact and longer term positive impact. Please include all potential impacts over the lifetime of a project and provide an explanation.</p>	<p>Positive impact (Place a X in the box below where</p>	<p>No impact (Place a X in the box below where</p>	<p>Negative impact (Place a X in the box below where</p>	<p>Explain why will it have this effect and over what timescale?</p> <p>Where possible/relevant please include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Changes over and above business as usual • Evidence or measurement of effect • Figures for CO₂e • Links to relevant documents 	<p>Explain how you plan to mitigate any negative impacts.</p>	<p>Explain how you plan to improve any positive outcomes as far as possible.</p>
<p>Minimise pollution (including air, land, water, light and noise)</p>		<p>*</p>		<p>The EV car club will be promoted in favour of private ICE vehicles and the overall impact of EV take up should see GHG emissions reductions. Hopefully less vehicles will travel into the centre of town.</p>		<p>62% of future emissions reductions depend on behaviour change so we will engage communities to seek buy in and drive this change.</p>
<p>Ensure resilience to the effects of climate change e.g. reducing flood risk, mitigating effects of drier, hotter summers</p>		<p>*</p>				
<p>Enhance conservation and wildlife</p>		<p>*</p>				

<p>How will this proposal impact on the environment?</p> <p>N.B. There may be short term negative impact and longer term positive impact. Please include all potential impacts over the lifetime of a project and provide an explanation.</p>	<p>Positive impact (Place a X in the box below where</p>	<p>No impact (Place a X in the box below where</p>	<p>Negative impact (Place a X in the box below where</p>	<p>Explain why will it have this effect and over what timescale?</p> <p>Where possible/relevant please include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Changes over and above business as usual • Evidence or measurement of effect • Figures for CO₂e • Links to relevant documents 	<p>Explain how you plan to mitigate any negative impacts.</p>	<p>Explain how you plan to improve any positive outcomes as far as possible.</p>
<p>Safeguard the distinctive characteristics, features and special qualities of North Yorkshire's landscape</p>		*				
<p>Other (please state below)</p>		*				

Are there any recognised good practice environmental standards in relation to this proposal? If so, please detail how this proposal meets those standards.

N/A

Summary Summarise the findings of your impact assessment, including impacts, the recommendation in relation to addressing impacts, including any legal advice, and next steps. This summary should be used as part of the report to the decision maker.

Submitting the response will have no climate change impact at this stage.

Sign off section

This climate change impact assessment was completed by:

Name	Keisha Moore
Job title	Transport Planning Officer
Service area	Highways and Transportation
Directorate	Environment
Signature	Keisha Moore
Completion date	01/11/2023

Authorised by relevant Assistant Director (signature): Barrie Mason

Date: 03/11/2023